Growth Mindset in Mind: Providing High Quality and Productive Feedback to Students in CCS 1001: College & Career Success

Christine Harrington
www.scholarlyteaching.org
drchristineharrington@gmail.com
Learning Outcomes

Discuss
- Discuss the important role growth mindset can play in feedback processes.

Determine
- Determine in person and online feedback strategies that will support student learning.

Incorporate
- Incorporate feedback opportunities into course design without overly taxing faculty time.
Why Feedback Matters

• Effort

• Achievement
  • Especially when feedback is timely and informative

Wisniewski et al., (2020); Hattie & Yates (2014)
Re-thinking Assignments: Feedback is An Equity Issue
(Taras, 2006)
Let’s Build Feedback into Course Design
Use Formative Assessments

Formative Assessments → Summative Assessment
“My professor designed the final project to be completed throughout the semester by making pieces of it due on certain weeks leading up to the final date. This gave us the opportunity to complete the assignment one part at a time and receive feedback at each point. After the first assignment, she gave thorough feedback on what we could improve on for the next phase of the assignment. This approach really helps us gain confidence and skills.”
Scaffolding Assignments

Low-High Stakes to Build Self-Efficacy

- No Stakes
- Low Stakes
- Moderate Stakes
- Higher Stakes

Breaking Down Assignments to Benefit from Feedback

- Topic
- Sources
- Outline/Draft
- Paper

Outline/Draft
- Paper

Sources
- Outline/Draft
- Paper

Topic
- Sources
- Outline/Draft
- Paper

No Stakes
- Outline/Draft
- Paper
Feedback: Linking Assignments

1. Rough Draft
2. Individual Paper
3. Power Point Slides
4. Presentation
Follow-up Assignments

- Require students to reflect on and use feedback with additional assignment components
“In this course, one of the major assignments was a group project that included a presentation and a paper. About halfway through the semester, the paper portion of this project was due. The professor graded the papers by the following class, and when he returned the papers to each group, he explained how we would be spending the entire class reviewing our papers. The professor then spoke to the whole class describing the requirements of this revision assignment. He told us that we would be receiving a separate grade for this second, revised submission. Knowing that this assignment was going to be graded again, we immediately became more interested in the notes and feedback that the professor had written on the returned papers. The professor then went to each group and spent 5–10 minutes discussing that group’s paper with the group members while the other groups were working on the presentation portion of the project.”
Small Group Breakout

How do you (or could you) build formative assessments into the CCS 1001 class?
Growth Mindset and Feedback

What Kind of Mindset Do You Have?

Growth Mindset

I can learn anything I want to.
When I'm frustrated, I persevere.
I want to challenge myself.
When I fail, I learn.
Tell me I try hard.
If you succeed, I'm inspired.
My effort and attitude determine everything.

Fixed Mindset

I'm either good at it, or I'm not.
When I'm frustrated, I give up.
I don't like to be challenged.
When I fail, I'm no good.
Tell me I'm smart.
If you succeed, I feel threatened.
My abilities determine everything.
Mueller and Dweck’s (1998) Study

Moderate Difficulty Puzzle → Feedback (Based on Group) → Difficult Puzzle → Moderate Difficulty Puzzle
Prediction Time:  
Who Performed the BEST?  
Who Performed the WORST on the last puzzle?

Experimental Group 1  
Ability:  
Wow you did really well, you must be SMART.

Experimental Group 2  
Effort:  
Wow you did really well, you must have WORKED HARD.

Control Group  
Control:  
Wow you did really well.
The Results...

![Graph showing the results of Puzzle 1 and Puzzle 3 for Ability, Effort, and Control. The graph indicates a linear increase in ability and effort from Puzzle 1 to Puzzle 3, while control shows a slight decrease.]
Students in Ability Praise group

- Solved less puzzles correctly
- Did not want to persist on tasks
- Did not enjoy the task as much
- as students in the effort praise group.
Our Role...

Help students attribute their mistakes to something that is INTERNAL and CHANGEABLE (like effort)!
# Growth Mindset: Limitations and Words of Caution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Luke Wood</th>
<th>Incomplete model that can unintentionally harm students of color</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students of color need to hear they have the ability too; may not have had this messaging before</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emphasizing effort only negates the impact of racism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Privilege

“As I started out, I felt like my feet were wings. I had gone for a longer than-usual run a few days before and decided that must be the cause of my improvement. It’s possible that I looked quite slow to anyone who saw me, but by my standards, I was zooming along. The Chariots of Fire theme song was going through my head. I felt like I reached the end of the first mile in no time. My hope had been to run the return route faster than the first mile, and I had no doubt in my mind I would be able to. But then I reached the end of the road and turned around. As I started my run back, I was gasping for breath and had to fight for each step. Remember, the road was pretty flat, so it’s not that I was now going uphill. No, what I realized as I ran that first block in the return direction was that I was now running headfirst against the wind. I was aware of that wind every step I took and knew that I had to expend a lot of energy to simply move forward. It was very obvious to me that the wind was an obstacle to my running prowess. It took me a little while to realize, however, that the same wind that was now making it so difficult for me to run had a few minutes earlier been pushing me along on the first half of my run. What I thought was a major breakthrough in my development as a runner was really just nature giving me a push. While I was constantly aware of the wind on the second half of my run, I hadn’t noticed it at all on the first half. Instead, in my mind my improved abilities were all because of me. I had thought I was becoming a damn good runner. As I was cooling down, I realized that this experience provides a metaphor for how privilege works in our society. Privilege is like the wind that was pushing me along. It surrounds us and gives some an added push—unearned benefits/advantages—that makes it easier to excel. The person running against the wind never forgets the wind is there. Similarly, many in our society can never forget that it is riddled with racism, sexism, class inequality, heterosexism, ableism, and religious intolerance. At the same time, others of us can go on blissfully unaware that the wind is at our backs. Our society is structured to keep that privilege invisible much of the time, and those with privilege often attribute their success to exactly the kinds of things I was thinking on the first half of my run: my success is because of my abilities, my hard work.” (Clifford, 2020, p. 75).
What Type of Feedback?
The Feedback Students Receive...
What Type of Feedback Do Students Get?
Stern and Solomon (2006)

- **Method:**
- 30 student portfolios (all their work during college) were randomly selected
- A total of 598 papers were reviewed
Feedback: Faculty Comments
Stern and Solomon (2006)

Percentage of papers with at least 1 comment

- Grammar and Punctuation: 52%
- Paragraph and sentence structure: 52%
- Word Choice: 49%
- Scholarly Advice: 6%
Is this what we want to emphasize?
What makes feedback effective?
Characteristics of Effective Feedback (Wlodkowski, 2008)

- Connected to a standard” (i.e. rubric)
- Informs the student
- Specific and constructive
- Prompt and frequent
Feedback Principles
Nichol and Macfarlane-Dick (2006)

- Clarifies goal
- Facilitates self-assessment
- Delivers high quality information
- Encourages dialogue
- Motivates
- Improves performance
- Guides teaching
Feedback Strategies
Resources that can Help

- Models - Sample Papers or Presentations
- Rubrics for Assignments
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>“D” or “F” Work</th>
<th>“B” or “C” Work</th>
<th>“A” Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intent</td>
<td>Inaccurate or minimal information included; Lack of organization or flow; Did not include original research studies</td>
<td>General overview of the topic; Accurate but missing important information. Difficult to differentiate between main points and details; Some details about at least 3 original studies</td>
<td>Comprehensive overview of the topic; Information was accurate and complete; Major points were emphasized; Good details about at least 3 original research studies; Well organized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Skills</td>
<td>Did not address three main themes. Limited to no research support for statements. Citations not used or inappropriately used. Several spelling and grammatical errors.</td>
<td>Good organization - included organization, described 3 main themes, conclusion summarized key points. Most statements supported by research. APA style was used. Few spelling and grammatical errors.</td>
<td>Well organized - clear introduction, description of approximately 3 main themes, and strong conclusion. Research supported all statements and APA Style was used. Free of grammatical and spelling errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources</td>
<td>Did not include at least 7 scholarly sources; Sources were not research based or related</td>
<td>At least 7 scholarly sources were used - some were not research based or not directly related to the topic</td>
<td>At least 7 scholarly sources were used; All sources directly related to topic. At least 3 original studies included</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consider Assigning Self-Assessment via Rubric
Question

What percentage of students understood the reason for the comments given by their professor?

- 10%
- 55%
- 65%
- 90%
Student Comprehension of Comments

Only 55% of the students understood the reason for the comment.

Taylor 2011
Do Students Understand our Feedback?

Voelkel and Mello (2014)
Use a Combination of Audio and Written Feedback
Feedback: How Much?

Ackerman & Gross (2010)

![Bar chart showing the negative impression of a student with different levels of feedback.](chart.png)
Focus on the Big Ideas: Prioritize the Placement of Most Important Feedback
Small Group Breakout

What would you say to a student who did not perform well on an assessment in the CCS 1001 class?
Monitoring Progress: Types of Feedback

- **Cognitive Feedback**
  - During homework or studying process

- **Outcome Feedback**
  - After students receive their grade
Cognitive Feedback Approaches

Landrum (2007); Di Hoff et al. (2003); Epstein et al. (2001)
Cognitive Feedback Approach

Power of VERBAL Feedback
Varied Types of Cognitive Feedback
Outcome Feedback

• **Assignment Wrapper**
  - How well do you think you did on this assignment? Why?
  - How accurate was your prediction?
  - What actions can you take based on the feedback provided?
Feedback can be time-consuming
Targeted Feedback

Feedback on one aspect of the assignment
Why Peer Feedback?

- Limited Instructor Time for Feedback
- Opportunity to Learn from Peers
- Exposure to Models
What are the challenges of peer feedback?
Challenges of Peer Feedback

- Limited Knowledge
- Too General
- Concern about Being Negative
- Uncomfortable in Role
- Possible Inaccurate or Misleading Feedback
Conveyer Belt Model (Facey, 2011)

- Divide Students into Several Groups
- Train Students on Specific Type of Feedback
- Use Class Time to Provide Feedback
An Example of the Conveyor Belt Model (Facey, 2011)
Faculty Role in Peer Evaluation

- Train Peers
- Conduct Quality Check
  - Consider Grading Feedback

This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under CC BY-ND
Feedback is Complex

Langer 2011
Emotions and Feedback
Reinforcing Strengths
Christina Christodoulou, Drew University
Questions?

drchristineharrington@gmail.com

www.scholarlyteaching.org

STYLUS DISCOUNT: HARR25